

W5 Out of Session Independent Review Committee Record – sent 13 November 2020

(downloaded from one drive and saved to [REDACTED])

No	Submission No. Property and Issue No./ Landholder Requests	NRAR Recommendation. Follow up clarification if requested by committee in bold.	HRC member: [REDACTED]	HRC member: [REDACTED]	HRC member: [REDACTED]	HRC member: [REDACTED]
1.	<p>G006 [REDACTED] [REDACTED]</p> <p>9. Landholder requesting additional storage and surge.</p> <p>Committee requested clarification on unconstructed floodplain harvesting works.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>Refer to document, legal advice emails dated 14 October 2020 and 9 November 2020.</p>	1. Endorse: N	<p>1. Endorse: N</p> <p>Do not support</p> <p>Additional storage and surge area.</p>	1. Endorse: N not eligible	1. Endorse: N Do not support
2	<p>N082 [REDACTED] (unregulated)</p> <p>1. Contesting volumetric conversion rate, supplied map evidence for correct climatic zone.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>1. Amend volumetric conversion rate from Zone 3 to Zone 4 based on corrected climatic zone (7.5ML to 9ML).</p> <p>Amend proposed FPH unregulated entitlement from 500ML to 713ML.</p> <p>Amended letter included in committee information.</p>	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y

3.	<p>N089 ██████████ (unregulated)</p> <p>1. Contesting volumetric conversion rate, supplied map evidence for correct climatic zone.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>1. Amend volumetric conversion rate Zone 4 based on corrected climatic zone (7.5ML to 9ML).</p> <p>Amend proposed FPH unregulated entitlement from 429.5ML to 668ML.</p> <p>Amended letter included in committee information.</p>	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y
4.	<p>N177 ██████████ (unregulated groundwater only)</p> <p>1. Contesting volumetric conversion rate, map evidence for correct climatic zone.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>1. Amend volumetric conversion rate from Zone 3 to Zone 4 based on corrected climatic zone (7.5ML to 9ML).</p> <p>Amend proposed FPH unregulated entitlement from 1650ML to 2181ML.</p> <p>Amended letter included in committee information.</p>	2. Endorse: Y	<p>2. Endorse: Y</p> <p>The submission has not supplied same level of evidence of property position as previous two submissions</p> <p>██████████ original ROI was reviewed as part of the Gwydir region. A letter from the Department on 10 February 2017 stated that they would be considered as part of the Namoi as the majority of their FPH water emanates from the Namoi. The marked-up map provided has been confirmed and they should have been included as Zone 4 for the purposes of</p>	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y

				<p>volumetric conversion.</p> <p>This was a Departmental oversight which should be corrected –</p> <p>██████</p>		
5.	<p>N074 ██████</p> <p>1. Requesting OFS1 change from 190ML to 252ML, an increase of 62ML.</p> <p>Requesting OFS2 change from 200ML to 433ML, an increase of 233ML.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>OFS1 – change from 190 ML to 239 ML, an increase of 49 ML at 1m freeboard.</p> <p>OFS2 – change from 200 ML to 395 ML, an increase of 195 ML at 1m freeboard</p>	1. Endorse: Y	<p>1. Endorse: Y or N</p> <p>No evidence was supplied with this submission</p> <p>Please see Document 5</p> <p>The document I downloaded sent on 13.11 in 2 Of 7 had no evidence included</p> <p>Submission resent with evidence attached</p> <p>Endorsed Y 5/2/21</p>	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Requesting addition of 54ML temporary storage in large channel.	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>2. Support addition of temporary storage of 54ML in large channel.</p>	2. Endorse: Y	<p>2. Endorse: Y or N</p> <p>No evidence was supplied with this submission or reference to 0.5m freeboard</p> <p>Please see Document 5</p> <p>Endorsed Y 5/2/21</p>	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y

6.	M016 ██████████ 1. Requesting inclusion of permanent storage in eligible works.	Recommend: 1. NRAR does <u>not</u> support the inclusion of OFS1 in eligible works.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y Y I am requiring more information as to why this storage is compliant, but not eligible for FPH when timing is ok Not eligible as it is in a riparian zone and is regarded as unregulated take. Not for FPH. Ok	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Requesting addition of FPH6 400mm axial pump with a capacity of 24 ML/day to eligible works.	Recommend: 2. FPH6 - NRAR does <u>not</u> support the inclusion of 400mm axial pump in eligible works.	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	2. Endorse: Y Y Is dependent on above dam or temp storage. If OFS1 is ineligible this is also ineligible. ok	2. Endorse: Y
	3. Requesting inclusion of pumps FPH4 - 500mm centrifugal pump with a capacity of 67ML/day and FPH5 - 350mm Axial pump with a capacity of 36ML/day as eligible works.	Recommend: 3. FPH4 - support addition of 500mm centrifugal pump with a capacity of 67ML/day FPH5 - support 350mm axial pump with a capacity of 36ML/day as eligible works.	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y

7.	M043 ██████ 1. Request to increase OFS1 from 420ML to 500ML, an increase of 80ML.	Recommend: 1. OFS1 – increase from 420ML to 462ML, an increase of 42ML.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y
8.	M029 ██████ 1. Contesting storage volume OFS1 and OFS2. Taken to committee meeting 2/3/21 Committee unanimous decision was that OFS1 and OFS2 remain at SBM volumes. ██████	Recommend: 1. OFS1 - an increase in volume from 640 ML to 720 ML may be supported based on NRAR analysis and the limited evidence supplied by landholder OFS2 - an increase in volume from 1530 ML to 1600 ML may be supported based on NRAR analysis and the limited evidence supplied by landholder.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: N Landholder should be required to supply evidence as per the provided template Additional evidence was requested for storages – not forthcoming. █████ maintaining position. 9/2/21 To be tabled at next committee meeting.	1. Endorse: Y Remarks - support NRAR reduced increase. Other wise they need to supply more technical info such as a curve Additional evidence was requested for storages – not forthcoming.	1. Endorse: Y Support reduced increase
	2. Requesting additional permanent storages OFS3 with a capacity of 1200 ML and OFS4 with a capacity of 1300 ML.	Recommend: 2. NRAR Supports addition of OFS3 with a volume of 1495ML and OFS4 with a volume of 1861 ML.	2. Endorse: N Valid Part 8 application for proposed works in 2002. Multiple objections. Put on hold until Macquarie FMP was gazetted. New application lodged to align with FMP. Original	2. Endorse: N Storages do not meet criteria. The application at 2002 was for levees not storages Valid Part 8 application for proposed works in 2002. Multiple objections. Put on hold until Macquarie FMP	2. Endorse: Y or N Remarks : I feel we need to have some discussion on this one. Valid Part 8 application for proposed works in 2002. Multiple objections. Put on hold until	2. Endorse: N Valid Part 8 application for proposed works in 2002. Multiple objections. Put on hold until Macquarie FMP was gazetted. New application lodged to align with FMP. Original application

	<p>Taken to committee meeting 2/3/21</p> <p>Committee unanimous decision was that OFS3 and OFS4 are not to be included as eligible works but can be included on WSWA .</p>		<p>application withdrawn. The storages were constructed in 2013 in line with the new approval.</p> <p>To be tabled 2 March 2021</p>	<p>was gazetted. New application lodged to align with FMP. Original application withdrawn. The storages were constructed in 2013 in line with the new approval.</p> <p>To be tabled 2 March 2021</p>	<p>Macquarie FMP was gazetted. New application lodged to align with FMP. Original application withdrawn. The storages were constructed in 2013 in line with the new approval. To be tabled 2 March 2021</p>	<p>withdrawn. The storages were constructed in 2013 in line with the new approval.</p> <p>To be tabled 2 March 2021</p>
9.	<p>M052</p> <p>1. Requesting an increase of 49ML in OFS1 from 1470 to 1519ML.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>1. OFS1 - increase of 49ML from 1470 ML to 1519 ML.</p>	<p>1. Endorse: Y</p>	<p>1. Endorse: Y</p> <p>Support NRAR recommendation</p>	<p>1. Endorse: Y</p> <p>Support NRAR</p>	<p>1. Endorse: Y</p>
	<p>2. Requesting an increase for the 600mm axial pump from 99ML/day to 120ML/day.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>2. Support change of 600mm axial pump from 99ML/day to 120ML/day.</p>	<p>2. Endorse: Y</p>	<p>2. Endorse: Y</p> <p>Support NRAR recommendation</p>	<p>2. Endorse: Y</p> <p>Support</p>	<p>2. Endorse: Y</p>
	<p>3. Inclusion of channel not mapped or included by NRAR during field inspection.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>3. Support inclusion of an additional channel.</p>	<p>3. Endorse: Y</p>	<p>3. Endorse: Y</p> <p>Support NRAR recommendation</p>	<p>3. Endorse: Y</p>	<p>3. Endorse: Y</p>
	<p>4. Inclusion of 900mm pipe where channel (issue 3) joins with Channel 19.</p>	<p>Recommend:</p> <p>4. Support inclusion of a 900mm pipe.</p>	<p>4. Endorse: Y</p>	<p>4. Endorse: Y</p> <p>Support NRAR recommendation</p>	<p>4. Endorse: Y</p>	<p>4. Endorse: Y</p>

	5. Inclusion of surge area (dryland) at bottom of farm that has been utilised to store excess runoff.	Recommend: 5. A surge volume of 720 ML is supported as temporary storage.	5. Endorse: Y	5. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	5. Endorse: Y Support NRAR	5. Endorse: Y
	6. Request inclusion of fields 16 and 17 for use as 500ML temporary storage.	Recommend: 6. Support 140ML of temporary storage only.	6. Endorse: Y	6. Endorse: Y	6. Endorse: Y Support NRAR	6. Endorse: Y
10	M042 [REDACTED] 1. Requesting four additional surge areas: 1.1 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] 1.2. [REDACTED] 1.3 [REDACTED] 1.4. OFS2 surge.	Recommend: 1.1 The [REDACTED] surge is <u>ineligible</u> due to on riparian zone. 1.2. [REDACTED] - support inclusion of surge area known as [REDACTED] with a volume of 22 ML 1.3. [REDACTED] is <u>ineligible</u> due to low order banks not providing required 0.5m freeboard 1.4. OFS2 surge is <u>ineligible</u> due to low order banks not providing required 0.5m freeboard.	6. Endorse: 1.1 Y 1.2 Y 1.3 Y 1.4 Y	6. Endorse: Y 1.1 Y 1.2 Y 1.3 Y 1.4 Y No evidence supplied with submission No additional evidence can be supplied. Information from NRAR is the best available. Only 1.2 is considered eligible by NRAR. Emailed submission – missing files 5/2/20 Emailed [REDACTED] 9/2/21 to request	6. Endorse: Y 1.1. Y 1.2. Y 1.3. Y 1.4. Y All Y to NRARs assessment Remarks: require more info, as other 3 might be drained after flood to reclaim farmed land so maybe needed to be taken into account for modelling purposes. They are low, inundated areas but the 0.5m freeboard criteria cannot be met.	6. Endorse: 1.1 Y 1.2 Y 1.3 Y 1.4 Y

11	M045 ██████████ 1. Requesting an increase in OFS1 from 100ML to 196ML, an increase of 96ML.	Recommend: 1. OFS1 - increase from 100 ML to 106ML, an increase of 6ML.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y Remarks Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Request inclusion of two temporary storages – fields 11, 12 and fields 3,4,5. Taken to committee meeting 2/3/21 Committee unanimous decision was that none of the fields are to be included as temporary storages. Evidence shows inundation during flood but no evidence the water has been held in the fields. ████████	Recommend: 2. Support inclusion of two one temporary storage – fields 11, 12 (200ML) Not supported fields 3,4,5.	2. Endorse: N Support amended NRAR information Y or N See amended NRAR information at end of document.	2. Endorse: N No volumes provided Support amended NRAR information Y or N See amended NRAR information at end of document. To be listed at next meeting 9/2/21 Request supporting info from modellers 200ML vs 100 ML? ████████ emailed to request info.	2. Endorse: Support amended NRAR information Y. Remarks; Do these fields have meters and how do they compare with the fields in the other valleys where we accepted some and rejected some, depending on criteria. See amended NRAR information at end of document.	2. Endorse: N
12.	M050 ██████████ 1. Request and increase in OFS2 storage and location.	Recommend: 1. OFS2 - support an increase of 240 ML from 60 ML to 192 ML.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR	1. Endorse: Y

	2. Requesting addition of 750mm pipe with gated end.	Recommend: 2. FPH6 - inclusion of pipe with gated end as eligible work.	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y
	3. Requesting inclusion of western section as Temporary Storage of 141ML.	Recommend: 3. Support inclusion of western section as temporary storage only with capacity 141ML.	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y
13	M101 1. Requesting amendment of pump FPH9 from 350mm to 400mm, and flow rate increased from 25 ML/day to 40 ML/day.	Recommend: 1. NRAR requested additional and more conclusive evidence but was not supplied. <u>Not supported.</u>	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR Remarks: Needs more evidence to agree to request No more evidence available	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Requesting amendment of pump FPH10 From 350mm to 400mm, and flow rate increased from 25 ML/day to 40 ML/day.	Recommend: 2. Support amendment of pump FPH10 from 300mm to 350mm , with flow rate increased from 22 ML/day to 34 ML/day. NRAR requested additional and more conclusive evidence but was not supplied.	2. Endorse: N	2. Endorse: N For consistency evidence must be supplied as requested in template No more evidence available Not consistent with next rec 3	2. Endorse: Need more evidence to support request No more evidence available N	2. Endorse: N Evidence does not justify request.

	3. Requesting amendment of pump FPH11 from 350mm to 400mm, and flow rate increased from 25 ML/day to 40 ML/day.	Recommend: 3. NRAR have requested additional conclusive evidence but not supplied. <u>Not supported.</u>	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	3. Endorse: Y to NRAR Y Need better evidence to support request No more evidence available	3. Endorse: Y
14	M074 1. Requesting an increase of OFS2 from 3150 to 4100ML, an increase of 850ML.	Recommend: 1. OFS2 – support amendment from 3150 to 3957ML, an increase of 807ML.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y Remarks: support NRAR assessment	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Requesting amendment of FPH30 from 500mm centrifugal at 65.0ML/day flow rate to 660mm centrifugal at 120ML/day flow rate.	Recommend: 2. FPH30 – support amendment of pump size to 660mm centrifugal with flow rate of 120 ML/day.	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y
	3. Requesting FPH8 additional surge areas as temporary storage with a volume of 183ML.	Recommend: 3. FPH8 – support additional surge areas as temporary storage with a volume of 183ML.	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y 9/2/21 confirmation email from [REDACTED] to follow Should be consistent use of 0.5m freeboard N.B. As the surge has a by wash outlet the maximum TWL results in a freeboard of 0.66m. Cannot achieve 0.5m freeboard for this storage.	3. Endorse: Y	3. Endorse: Y

	4. Requesting FPH8 additional surge areas with a volume of 32ML.	Recommend: 4. FPH8 – support additional surge areas with a volume of 32ML.	4. Endorse: Y	4. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	4. Endorse: Y	4. Endorse: Y
15	M057 ██████████ 1. Requesting OFS1 storage volume from 660ML to 842ML, an increase of 182ML.	Recommend: 1. OFS1 – support an increase 660ML to 842ML, an increase of 182ML.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Requesting FPH2 surge volume is amended from 50 ML to 119 ML, an increase of 69 ML	2. FPH 2 - amended from 50 ML to 116ML , 119ML, an increase of 69 ML.	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y Conflicting volume in NRAR recommendation 116 ML in analysis NRAR has confirmed that it should be 119ML.	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y
16	M075 ██████████ 1. Requesting OFS1 storage volume change from 340ML to 412ML, an increase of 72ML.	1. OFS1 – amend from 340ML to 389ML, an increase of 49ML with a 1M freeboard.	1. Endorse: Y	1. Endorse: Y Support NRAR recommendation	1. Endorse: Y To NRAR assessment	1. Endorse: Y
	2. Requesting addition of 2 channels and a 750mm pipe to eligible works.	2. Moderate evidence for addition of two channels and one 750mm pipe to eligible works.	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: N Y after additional evidence 2/2/21 Photographic evidence is inconclusive	2. Endorse: Y	2. Endorse: Y

				<p>Document 8 shows the location of the works.</p> <p>NRAR confirmed works via LiDAR. See below. Compare to Document 8 in submission</p>		
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

M075 [REDACTED] – Issue 2



Issue Number	2
Description	Inclusion of two temporary storages to eligible works
Evidence Supplied	Aerial photos of flooding and coordinates
Landholder Requesting	Inclusion of temporary storages for eligibility, modelling and future compliance.
NRAR Data	Aerial imagery and LiDAR
Photograph of work with verification of location and date	Yes – aerial imagery of one flood event in 1990.
Marked up map/image of works location	No, though coordinates were provided
HFP Analysis	<p>Landholder provided aerial images of the areas inundated in the major flood of 2012 when there was flooding all over.</p> <p>Surface Water Analysis tool shows -</p> <p>West fields F 11, 12 have been partly inundated occasionally – 2/3 covered in some years. LiDAR analysis shows that the banks are overtopped at about 0.3m deep in the field. Could adopt average depth of 0.25m over area 80 ha for a temporary storage volume of 200 ML.</p> <p>East fields F 3, 4, 5 have never had more than a small area wetted by local runoff in the observation period back to before 1990. The banks around the bottom end of the fields would hold a maximum of about 0.3m deep. There is high ground in the fields limiting the extent that could be flooded. It is considered that these have not been used as temporary storages.</p> <p>The capacity of the permanent storage has been determined to be 106 ML at freeboard 1.0m. Filled to ToB level is 196 ML. A temporary storage of 200 ML is nominated above. More than this would be of no benefit to fph.</p> <p>SUMMARY:</p> <p>MODERATE evidence supplied for inclusion of temporary storage volume of 200 ML in the western fields F 11, 12. See map below.</p> <p>Inclusion of part of the request is <u>supported (Fields 11 and 12)</u></p> <p>Fields 3, 4 & 5 not supported as temporary storages</p>